IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO WESTERN DIVISION

BILLY BRANTLEY, et al. Case No. C-1-01-378 Plaintiffs, Judge Michael H. Watson VS. SUPPLEMENTAL CINERGY CORP. AFFIDAVIT OF KEN **TOEBBE** Defendant.

STATE OF OHIO))ss. COUNTY OF HAMILTON

Comes now affiant, Ken Toebbe, after being duly cautioned and sworn, states as follows:

- 1. That I am presently employed by The Cincinnati Gas & Electric Company ("CG&E") as Manager of T&D Projects from 1998 to the present and my job responsibilities include acting as the Hiring Manager responsible for coordinating and scheduling the hiring process for the Lineperson Apprentice Program.
- 2. That as part of my job responsibilities, I am familiar with employment and personnel records of employees in the Electric T&D C&M department of CG&E.

- 3. That John Huwell is a retired employee who was employed by CG&E in the Electric T&D C&M department.
- That Exhibit "A" is a true and accurate copy of a Certification of 4. Oral Warning issued to Richard Cutsinger by John Huwell on or about November 15, 1993.
- 5. That Exhibit "A" is a true and accurate copy of a business record of CG&E which records information which was made at or near the time by or from a person with knowledge in the course of CG&E's regularly conducted business activity and is a employment or personnel record of Richard Cutsinger, employed by CG&E in the Electric T&D C&M department on or about November 2003.
 - 6. That I have firsthand knowledge of the above.

FURTHER AFFIANT SAYETH NAUGHT.

NOTARY OF PUBLIC

Sworn to and subscribed in my presence this 27th day of October, 2004.

Public

JILL T. O'SHEA, ATTORNEY AT LAW NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF OHIO MY COMMISSION HAS NO EXPIRATION DATE. SECTION 147.03 O.R.C.

Page 3 of 5

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jill T. O'Shea

Jill T. O'Shea (0034692) Attorney for Defendant, Cinergy Corp. 139 East Fourth Street – 25 AT II P.O. Box 960 Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960 (513) 287-2062

/s/ Gregory V. Mersol

Gregory V. Mersol (0030838) John B. Lewis (0013156) **BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP** 3200 National City Center 1900 East Ninth St. Cleveland, OH 44114-3485 Telephone: (216) 621-0200 Facsimile: (216) 696-0740

Attorneys for Defendant Cinergy Corp.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing pleading was forwarded via ordinary mail this 28th day of October, 2004 to:

Paul H. Tobias David D. Kammer TOBIAS, KRAUS & TORCHIA, LLP 414 Walnut Street Suite 911 Cincinnati, OH 45202

David W. Sanford, Esq. Sanford, Wittels & Heisler, LLP 2120 K Street NW Suite 700 Washington, D.C. 20037

Barry Vaughn Frederick Herman Nathaniel Johnson, Jr. Robert L. Wiggins Ann K. Wiggins Susan Donahue Robert F. Childs Wiggins, Childs, Quinn & Pantazis, P.C. 1400 South Trust Tower 420 North 20th Street Birmingham, Alabama 35203

Grant E. Morris Law Offices of Grant E. Morris 7 DuPont Circle, N.W. Suite 250 Washington, D.C. 20036

> /s/ Jill T. O'Shea Jill T. O'Shea

CERTIFICATION OF AN ORAL WARNING

This management file memo is to record that on the date stated below, the said employee was counseled concerning the matter(s) listed in this memo.

It was explained to said employee that this oral warning has been issued in lieu of other disciplinary action, and unless immediate improvement is made in the area(s) mentioned, further disciplinary action will be necessary.

Area(s) necessary for improvement:

During a meeting on November 3, 1993 in the presence of Messer J. Murphy, you were counseled about the threat you made toward another employee that was working with you. (That you were going to punch him in his black face).

This type of threat and comments are not acceptable in our work place. You were cautioned about this type of behavior and also made aware that future problems of this type would result in more serious disciplinary action, including possible dismissal from the company.

	400/
EMPLOYEE'S NAME TICKARD CUBINGUE	SUPERVISOR The Hund
DATE 11-15-93	SUPERVISOP.